

# 아원자 의미론과 함의

(Subatomic Semantics and Entailment)

이 영현

(조선대학교)

younglee@mail.chosun.ac.kr

http://www.chosun.ac.kr/~younglee

## 1. 문제의 제기

첫째, 술부부사와 술어의 함의

- (1) a. Brutus stabbed Caesar in the back.
- b. Brutus stabbed Caesar
- (1a)  $\models$  (1b), where  $\models$  means ENTAILS

둘째, 논리식의 비정형화 (n-항 술어)

- (2) a. Brutus stabbed Caesar in the back with something.  
     $\rightarrow (\exists w)P(\text{Brutus, Caesar, Caesar's back, } w): P = 4\text{-place-predicate}$
- b. Brutus stabbed Caesar  
     $\rightarrow (\exists z)(\exists w)P(\text{Brutus, Caesar, } z, w) : P = 4\text{-place-predicate}$
- (3) a. **Brutus** stabbed **Caesar** in the **back** through his **toga** with the **knife** at **noon** at the **bridge** under the **arch**.  
    b.  $\text{Stab}(b, c, b, t, k, n, b, a)$  8-place-predicate

셋째, 형용사와 유도 부사의 의미적 동일성

- (4) a. John sings a song **loudly**
- b. John sings a **loud** song

넷째, 사역(Causative)동사와 기동(inchoative)동사의 의미

- (5) a. Mary closes the door  $\Rightarrow \text{close}(m, \text{door}) \rightarrow \text{TV}$
- b. The door closes.  $\Rightarrow \text{close}(\text{door}) \rightarrow \text{IV}$
- c. The door is closed  $\Rightarrow \text{be-closed}(\text{door}) \rightarrow \text{Ad}$
- (5a)  $\models$  (5b) : TV  $\models$  IV 타동사  $\models$  자동사  $\models$  형용사

다섯째, 조건 논리식의 문제 (예화;instantiation)

- (6)  $p \rightarrow q$
- $q \rightarrow r$
- $\therefore p \rightarrow r$

- (7) 비가 오면 땅이 젖는다.
- 땅이 젖으면 신발이 젖는다.
- $\therefore$  비가 오면 신발이 젖는다.

- (8) 물질이라면 원소로 되어있다.  
 원소라면 눈에 보이지 않는다.  
 \* ∴ 물질이라면 눈에 보이지 않는다.

여섯째, 수식어의 제한

- (9) a. 큰 개미는 작은 동물이다.  
 b. 작은 코끼리는 큰 동물이다.  
 (10) a. \*큰 개미는 큰 동물이다.  
 b. \*작은 코끼리는 작은 동물이다.

## 2. Subatomic semantics

### 2.1 Formal Notation

#### \* basic idea

ex: **Caesar Died.**  
 For some event *e*,  
*e* is a dying, **and**  
 the object of *e* is Caesar, **and**  
*e* culminates before now

#### \* formal noation

$(\exists e) [Dying(e) \wedge Object(e, Caesar) \wedge Culminate(e, before\ now)]$			
↑	↑	↑	↑
default	verb	subject	tense

Predicate = <event, state>: subatomic Predicate : <**Cul**, **Hold**>

event: stab, walk, sing : <event, cul>

state: have, sat, is : <state, Hold>

- (11) a. Brutus is clever  
 $\rightarrow (\exists s)[s \text{ is a stae of being clever} \wedge Subject(s, Brutus) \wedge \mathbf{Holds}(s, now)]$   
 b. Brutus is under the tree  
 $\rightarrow (\exists s)[Under(s, the\ tree) \wedge Subject(s, Brutus) \wedge \mathbf{Holds}(s, now)]$   
 c. Brutus sat under the tree  
 $\rightarrow (\exists s)[Under(s, the\ tree) \wedge Subject(s, Brutus) \wedge \mathbf{Holds}(s, before\ now)]$   
 d. Brutus played the piano under the tree  
 $\rightarrow (\exists e)[Playing(e) \wedge Agent(e, Brutus) \wedge Theme(e, piano) \wedge Under(e, tree) \wedge \mathbf{Cul}(e, before\ now)]$

### 2.2 문장부사와 양화사

- (12) Possibly, every boy dates a girl. (in PL)  
 $\Rightarrow Possibly(x)(Boy(x) \rightarrow (\exists y)(Girl(y) \wedge x \text{ dates } y))$   
 (13) Possibly, every boy dates a girl. (in SAS)  
 $\Rightarrow x \text{ dated } y = (\exists e)(e \text{ is a dating} \wedge x \text{ is the agent of } e \wedge y \text{ is the object of } (e) \wedge$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{Cul}(e, \text{now}) \\
\Rightarrow & = (\exists e)(\text{Date}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y) \wedge \text{Cul}(e, \text{now})) \\
\Rightarrow & = \text{PRESENT}(\exists e)(\text{Date}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y) \wedge \text{Cul}(e)) \\
\Rightarrow & \text{Possibly } (x)(\text{Boy}(x) \rightarrow (\exists y)(\text{Girl}(y) \wedge (\exists e)(\text{Date}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y) \\
& \quad \wedge \text{Cul}(e, \text{now}))))
\end{aligned}$$

### 3. 형식적 기술

첫째 논리적 표시와 함의

- (14) a. John walks slowly  $\rightarrow$  SW(j) or (S(W))(j)  
b. John walks.  $\rightarrow$  W(j)
- (14)' \* (S(W))(j)  $\models$  (W(j))
- (15) a. Brutus stabbed Caesar violently  $\rightarrow$  Stab violently(b,c)  
a. Brutus stabbed Caesar  $\rightarrow$  S(b,c)
- (15)' \* Stab violently (b,c)  $\models$  S(b,c)
- (16) a. Brutus stabbed Caesar in the back.  $\rightarrow$  Stab-in-the-back(b,c)  
b. Brutus stabbed Caesar  $\rightarrow$  Stab(b,c)  
c. Stab Caesar in the back  $\rightarrow$  Stab(c, back)
- (17) a. x stabbed y  $\rightarrow$  Sxy  
b. x stabbed y violently  $\rightarrow$  Vxy  
c. x stabbed y with z  $\rightarrow$  Wxyz  
d. x stabbed y violently with z  $\rightarrow$  Gxyz
- (18) a. Sxy  $\rightarrow$   $(\exists e)[\text{Stabbling}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y)]$   
b. Vxy  $\rightarrow$   $(\exists e)[\text{Stabbling}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y) \wedge \text{violent}(e)]$   
c. Wxyz  $\rightarrow$   $(\exists e)[\text{Stabbling}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y) \wedge \text{with}(e,z)]$   
d. Gxyz  $\rightarrow$   $(\exists e)[\text{Stabbling}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y) \wedge \text{violent}(e) \wedge \text{With}(e,z)]$
- (19) a.  $(\exists e)[\text{Stabbling}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y)]$   
b.  $(\exists e)[\text{Stabbling}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y) \wedge \text{violent}(e)]$   
 $(\exists e)[\text{Stabbling}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y) \wedge \text{violent}(e)] \models$   
 $(\exists e)[\text{Stabbling}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, x) \wedge \text{Object}(e, y)]$
- (20) p  $\wedge$  q  
-----  
p
- (21) a. John met Mary in the park.  
 $\rightarrow$   $(\exists e) [\text{Met}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, J) \wedge \text{Object}(e, M) \wedge \text{at}(e, p)]$   
b. John met Mary  
 $\rightarrow$   $(\exists e) [\text{Met}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, J) \wedge \text{Object}(e, M)]$
- (22)  $(\exists e) [\text{Met}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, J) \wedge \text{Object}(e, M) \wedge \text{at}(e, p)]$   
 $\models (\exists e) [\text{Met}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, J) \wedge \text{Object}(e, M)]$

둘째, 형용사와 부사의 동일성

(23) a. John sings a song loudly

b. John sings a loud song

(23)' a.  $(\exists x)[\text{Song}(x) \wedge \text{Sing loudly}(j, x)]$

b.  $(\exists x)[\text{Loud}(\text{Song})(x) \wedge \text{Sing}(j, x)]$

(24) a.  $(\exists x)[(\text{Song}(x) \wedge (\exists e)[\text{Sing}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, \text{John}) \wedge \text{Object}(e, x) \wedge \text{Loud}(e)])]$

b.  $(\exists x)[((\text{Song}(x) \wedge \text{Loud}(x)) \wedge (\exists e)[\text{Sing}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, \text{John}) \wedge \text{Object}(e, x)])]$

where  $(\exists x)[\text{Song}(x) \wedge (\exists e)[\text{Sing}(e) \wedge \text{Loud}(e)]]$

$= (\exists x)[((\text{Song}(x) \wedge \text{Loud}(x)) \wedge (\exists e)[\text{Sing}(e)])]$

because 'a song loudly = a loud song, that is,  $(\exists x)[\text{Loud}(x)] = (\exists e)[\text{Loud}(e)]$

셋째, 타동사와 자동사의 상호관계

TV (break) : to break the window  $\models$  IV (break) :to cause the window to break

IV (break) : For the window to break  $\models$  Adj(broken) :For it to become broken.

(25) John closes the door

$\rightarrow (\exists e)[\text{Cul}(e) \wedge \text{Agent}(e, \text{john}) \wedge (\exists e')[\text{Closing}(e') \wedge \text{Cul}(e') \wedge \text{Theme}(e', \text{door}) \wedge \text{CAUSE}(e, e') \wedge (\exists s)[\text{being-closed}(s) \wedge \text{Theme}(s, \text{door}) \wedge \text{Hold}(s) \wedge \text{BECOME}(e', s)]]]$

(26) The door closes.

$\rightarrow (\exists e)[\text{Cul}(e) \wedge \text{Theme}(e, \text{door}) \wedge (\exists s)[\text{being-closed}(s) \wedge \text{Theme}(s, \text{door}) \wedge \text{Hold}(s) \wedge \text{BECOME}(e', s)]]]$

(27)  $(\exists e)[\text{Cul}(e) \wedge \text{Agent}(e, \text{john}) \wedge (\exists e')[\text{Closing}(e') \wedge \text{Cul}(e') \wedge \text{Theme}(e', \text{door}) \wedge \text{CAUSE}(e, e') \wedge (\exists s)[\text{being-closed}(s) \wedge \text{Theme}(s, \text{door}) \wedge \text{Hold}(s) \wedge \text{BECOME}(e', s)]]]$

$\rightarrow (\exists e)[\text{Cul}(e) \wedge \text{Theme}(e, \text{door}) \wedge (\exists s)[\text{being-closed}(s) \wedge \text{Theme}(s, \text{door}) \wedge \text{Hold}(s) \wedge \text{BECOME}(e', s)]]]$

$\therefore \mathbb{P}[(\exists e)[\text{Cul}(e) \wedge \text{Theme}(e', \text{door}) \wedge (\exists s)[\text{being-closed}(s) \wedge \text{Theme}(s, \text{door}) \wedge \text{Hold}(s) \wedge \text{BECOME}(e', s)]]] \wedge \mathbb{Q} [\text{Agent}(e, \text{john}) \wedge (\exists e')[\text{Closing}(e') \wedge \text{Cul}(e') \wedge \text{Theme}(e', \text{door}) \wedge \text{CAUSE}(e, e') \wedge \text{Theme}(s, \text{door})]]]$

$\rightarrow \mathbb{P}[(\exists e)[\text{Cul}(e) \wedge \text{Theme}(e, \text{door}) \wedge (\exists s)[\text{being-closed}(s) \wedge \text{Theme}(s, \text{door}) \wedge \text{Hold}(s) \wedge \text{BECOME}(e', s)]]]$

(28)  $(p \wedge q) \rightarrow p$

넷째, 조건 논리식의 문제

(29) a. In every burning, oxygen is consumed.

b. John burned the wood.

c. Oxygen was consumed.

(30)' a.  $(e)[\text{Burning}(e) \rightarrow (\exists e')[\text{Consuming}(e') \wedge \text{Object}(e', \text{O}_2) \wedge \text{In}(e, e')]]]$

b.  $(\exists e)[\text{Burning}(e) \wedge \text{Subject}(e, \text{John}) \wedge \text{Object}(e, \text{wood})]$

c.  $(\exists e')[\text{Consuming}(e') \wedge \text{Object}(e', \text{O}_2)]$

(a) and (b)  $\models$  (c)

#### 4. 형용사의 의미

##### 한정 형용사의 종류

###### a. predicate

(31) a. x is a red house

b. x is a house  $\wedge$  x is red

(32) x is a clever teacher and x is a parent

$\Rightarrow$  x is clever  $\wedge$  x is a teacher  $\wedge$  x is a parent

$\therefore$  x is clever  $\wedge$  x is a parent (from a and b) (predicate)

$\therefore$  x is a clever teacher but not a clever parent (violet predicate use)

(33) a. x is a clever N (predicate use)

b. x is clever  $\wedge$  x is N for an F

(where F is supplied from context or F is the same as N)

###### b. operator

(34) a. x is a former president

b. Formerly(x is president)

(35) a. x is a clever N (operator use)

b. Clever(x is an N that is F)

b'. x is an N  $\wedge$  x is clever for an F

###### c. attributive

(36) a. Mary is clever

b. \* x is clever  $\wedge$  x is Mary

(There is no argument for the operator to operate on)

c. \* Clever(Mary) (violate operator use)

다섯째, 수식어의 문제

(37) a. 코끼리는 큰 동물이다.

b. \*개미는 큰 동물이다.

(38) a. 작은 개미는 작은 동물이다.

b. 큰 개미는 작은 동물이다.

(39) a. \*작은 개미는 큰 동물이다.

b. \*큰 개미는 큰 동물이다.

(40) a. ? 작은 개미는 작은 곤충이다.

b. ? 큰 개미는 큰 곤충이다.

(41) a. ? 큰 개미는 작은 곤충이다.

b. ? 작은 개미는 큰 곤충이다.

(42) a. ?? 큰 개미는 작은 생물이다.

b. ?? 작은 개미는 큰 생물이다.

(43) a. 코끼리는 큰 동물이다.

- b. \*코끼리는 작은 동물이다.
- (44) a. 코끼리는 큰 포유동물이다.  
b. \*코끼리는 작은 포유동물이다.
- (45) a. 코끼리는 큰 생물이다.  
b. \*코끼리는 작은 생물이다.
- (46) a. 큰 개미  $\Rightarrow$  크다(x)  $\wedge$  개미(x)  
b. 작은 동물  $\Rightarrow$  작다(x)  $\wedge$  동물(x)
- (47) 큰 개미는 작은 동물이다.  $\Rightarrow (\exists x)(\exists y)[\{\text{크다}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x)\} \subseteq \{\text{작다}(y) \wedge \text{동물}(y)\}]$
- (48) 개미는 동물이다.  
 $\Rightarrow (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists \epsilon)[x \in y \wedge \text{코끼리}(x) \wedge \text{동물}(y) \wedge \text{크다}(y) \wedge \text{Hold}(\epsilon, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[s \text{ is a state such that } x \text{ is a member of } y \wedge \text{코끼리}(x) \wedge \text{동물}(y) \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{코끼리}(x) \wedge \text{동물}(y) \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$
- (49) 큰 개미는 작은 동물이다.  
 $\Rightarrow (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{큰 개미} \wedge \text{작은 동물} \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{크다}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x) \text{ for } N \wedge \text{작다}(y) \wedge \text{동물}(y) \text{ for } N \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{크다}(x) \wedge [\text{개미}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x)] \wedge \text{작다}(y) \wedge [\text{동물}(y) \wedge \text{동물}(y)] \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{크다}(x) \wedge [\text{개미}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x)] \wedge \text{작다}(y) \wedge [\text{동물}(y) \wedge \text{동물}(y)] \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
where;  $y \in \{\text{개미, 참새, \dots}\}$   
ex: 개미(x)  $\wedge$  동물(개미)
- (50) \*큰 개미는 큰 동물이다.  
 $\Rightarrow (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{큰 개미} \wedge \text{큰 동물} \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{크다}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x) \text{ for } N \wedge \text{크다}(y) \wedge \text{동물}(y) \text{ for } N \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{크다}(x) \wedge [\text{개미}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x)] \wedge \text{크다}(y) \wedge \text{동물}(y) \wedge \text{동물}(y) \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
where;  $y \in \{\text{곰, 소, 호랑이, \dots}\}$   
 $\therefore (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \notin y] \wedge x \text{ 크다} \wedge [\text{개미}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x)] \wedge \text{크다}(y) \wedge [\text{동물}(y) \wedge \text{동물}(y)] \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
where;  $y \in \{\text{곰, 소, 호랑이, \dots}\}$   
ex: 개미(x)  $\wedge$  동물(곰)
- (41) ? 큰 개미는 작은 곤충이다.  
 $\Rightarrow (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{큰 개미} \wedge \text{작은 곤충} \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{크다}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x) \text{ for } N \wedge \text{작다}(y) \wedge \text{곤충}(y) \text{ for } N \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{크다}(x) \wedge [\text{개미}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x)] \wedge \text{작다}(y) \wedge [\text{곤충}(y) \wedge \text{곤충}(y)] \wedge \text{Hold}(s, \text{now})]$   
 $= (\exists x)(\exists y)(\exists s)[[s \text{ is a state } | x \in y] \wedge \text{크다}(x) \wedge [\text{개미}(x) \wedge \text{개미}(x)] \wedge \text{작}$

다( $y$ )  $\wedge$  [곤충( $y$ )  $\wedge$  곤충( $y$ )]  $\wedge$  Hold( $s$ , now)]  
where;  $y \in \{\text{파리, 모기, 개미, 잠자리, 메뚜기, \dots}\}$   
ex: 개미( $x$ )  $\wedge$  [곤충(개미) or 곤충(모기)]

### 참고문헌

- 김영철 (1983), 조건논리에 관한 연구, 박사학위 논문, 전북대학교 대학원  
이기용 (1998) 상황과 정보, 대학사, 서울  
이익환 (1995) 의미론개론. 한신문화사. 서울  
Parsons, Terence (1990) *Events in the semantic of English: A study in subatomic semantics*, The MIT Press, Massachusetts  
Kamp, H. and U Reyle (1993), *From Discourse to Logic* (Part I), Kluwer Academic Publishing, Dordrecht.